

RELIGION 840: 394: 01 (undergraduate)

RELIGION 840: 515 (M.A. Level)

CHRISTIANS, THE “OTHER”, AND VIOLENCE

FALL 2013

Professor Tia Kolbaba

Office: 112 Loree Hall (Douglass Campus)

Phone: 732-932-9641

E-mail: kolbaba@rci.rutgers.edu

Office hours: Wednesday 10-noon; **appointments available at other times—just ask!**

The objectives of this course are

1. to introduce the history of various instances in which Christians are the victims or perpetrators of violence.
2. to introduce the primary texts in which Christians explain, justify, condone, or condemn that violence.
3. to introduce some of the (voluminous) secondary literature that seeks to interpret and analyze the relationship between Christianity or Christians, on the one hand, and violence, on the other.

By the end of the semester, students will be able to

1. describe various Christian attitudes toward the use of violence from the earliest Christian writings (1st century CE) to the Catholic and Protestant Reformations of the 16th century.
2. link specific Christian attitudes to the historical context in which they arose, formulating arguments about the relationship between context and ideas.
3. summarize the ideas of several influential scholars about the relationship between Christianity (or religion in general) and social conflict: specifically, to summarize the arguments of those who see an essential connection between religion and violence (for example, Hector Avalos, Regina M. Schwartz) and those who consider such claims at best exaggerated, at worst completely invalid (for example, Robert Eisen, Thomas Neufeld).

Books: for undergraduates, NONE. All readings for the course are either on sakai (sakai.rutgers.edu) or on other websites, which are detailed in the syllabus below.

It will be helpful to have a Bible, but even that is optional. If you don't have a Bible, go to biblegateway.com. If you want to buy a Bible, I recommend either the Harper-Collins Study Bible (**ISBN-10:** 0060786841, **ISBN-13:** 978-0060786847) or the New Oxford Annotated Bible (**ISBN-10:** 019528478X, **ISBN-13:** 978-0195284782).

For M.A. students: there are several books which we are reading either all or most of. You may want to purchase these. If you cannot purchase them, please get a copy of each from the library; you will need to have them for extended periods—maybe for most of the semester.

These are as follows:

- Regina M. Schwartz, *The Curse of Cain. The Violent Legacy of Monotheism* ISBN-10: 0226742008 ISBN-13: 978-0226742007
- Michael Gaddis, *There Is No Crime for Those Who Have Christ. Religious Violence in the Christian Roman Empire.* ISBN-10: 0520241045 | ISBN-13: 978-0520241046 |
- Elizabeth Castelli, *Martyrdom and Memory. Early Christian Culture Making.* ISBN-10: 0231129874 ISBN-13: 978-0231129879
- Thomas Sizgorich, *Violence and Belief in Late Antiquity. Militant Devotion in Christianity and Islam.* ISBN-10: 0812241134 | ISBN-13: 978-0812241136

Self-Reporting of Absences

In accordance with University policy, if you expect to miss a class, please use the University absence reporting website <https://sims.rutgers.edu/ssra> to indicate the date and reason for your absence

Attendance: I usually have one of those legalistic attendance policies where more than 3 absences = a grade penalty, etc. But this class is different. The topic does not lend itself to quizzes and tests and lectures. It DOES lend itself to collaborative learning. That is, if we are all going to benefit from the class, if we are all going to be more educated at the end of it, then we all need the input of everyone else in the class. This is material, in short, that needs discussion, challenge, questioning. If you do not want to do that, it will be your loss and ours. So, I am not going to lay down some set of laws. I am trusting you to come to class. I am hoping it's all so interesting that you look forward to coming to class.

The best way to teach is to do so in small groups. Instead of lecturing about *what I think you don't know* and should know, I can listen and get constant feedback about *what you actually don't know* and want to know. I can have a clear sense of which students need which bits of information. Most of all, we can spend less time delivering and receiving information (something, after all, that anyone can do on the internet) and more time processing, synthesizing, analyzing, and arguing about the meaning(s) of that information. This course has no right-or-wrong answers, no black-and-white issues. Everything comes wrapped in historical contexts. Some days everything will just seem completely confusing or even nonsensical. **It will only be a success if everyone participates. If everyone participates it will be far beyond a success—it will be educational and enlightening in the best possible way.**

What it means to participate, arranged (as students so often like it to be) in terms of grades:

First, please note: every PASSING grade depends upon your HAVING DONE THE READING!!!!

A: A student who receives an **A** for participation in discussion comes to every class with questions or comments about the readings. These questions or comments go beyond issues of fact and background to address the central arguments of the readings. An **A** discussant engages others about ideas, respects the opinions of others, and consistently elevates the level of discussion. Needless to say, the **A** student has done the reading.

B: A student who receives a **B** for participation in discussion may not always come to class with questions about the readings or may have only questions about facts and background. A **B** discussant may wait passively for others to raise interesting issues. Some discussants in this category, while courteous and articulate, do not adequately listen to other participants or relate their comments to the direction of the conversation.

C: A student who receives a **C** for participation attends regularly but may be an infrequent or unwilling participant. A student may receive a **C** if it becomes obvious to the professor that s/he has not done the reading, not done it carefully, or not understood it *and not asked for help*. (In other words, it is no crime to not understand the reading, but if you don't understand then you need to get help: e-mail or talk to Professor Kolbaba; ask a classmate; ask a friend.) A student who has not done the reading carefully may receive a **C** even if s/he talks a lot in class.

D: A student who regularly fails to prepare adequately for discussion risks the grade of **D**. **Or even F.**

Some hints that may help you get started participating (especially if you are a bit shy):

- Take notes as you read of anything that you don't understand.
- Then try to phrase your confusion as a question or series of questions. Write them out, if that helps, and bring them to class.
- Take notes as you read of anything that seems illogical, of any flaws in the argument, and/or of anything that just makes you think, "No way!" You can note things that make you angry, as well, or that completely contradict everything you have been taught before now.
- Again try to phrase your objections and criticism as a question or series of questions. Write them out, if that helps, and bring them to class.

It is perfectly acceptable to read your question from a piece of paper or a computer or tablet screen—especially if you have a hard time speaking to the class. (I hope we will all quickly get comfortable enough to overcome shyness, but until then do whatever you need to be able to participate.)

Calendar

Thursday, Sept. 5: Introduction to the Course. Syllabus discussion. Definition of violence discussion.

Week 1

Definitions of religion and violence. Principles for the study of religion.

What is religion? What is the academic study of religion? What kinds of debates frame the academic study of religion?

What constitutes violence? How do we define violence? When does society condemn violence? When does it condone violence?

What does it mean to argue that religion *causes* violence? Or that religion *caused* violence in a particular historical instance?

Monday, Sept. 9:

Reading (everyone): Gary E. Kessler, *Western Ways of Being Religious*, “A Challenge”, pp. 3-6; “What is Religion”, pp. 17-20; “The Search for Family Resemblances in Religion”, pp. 21-24. On sakai.

Reading (M.A. students only): another essay that defines religion and sets out principles for the study of religion from a textbook or reader. Consult Professor Kolbaba about finding one.

Thursday, Sept. 12:

Reading (everyone): “Introduction” to Hector Avalos, *Fighting Words*. On sakai.

Reading (M.A. students only): Regina M. Schwartz, *The Curse of Cain. The Violent Legacy of Monotheism*, beginning-p. 76.

Writing assignment (M.A. students only): an essay about 500 words in length assessing, critiquing, and comparing the two essays on the academic study of religion that you have read. Submitted as an e-mail attachment to Professor Kolbaba (Kolbaba@rci.rutgers.edu) by 9 a.m. Thursday, Sept. 12.

Extra meeting, Professor and M.A. students: discussing Schwartz, *Curse of Cain*, 1-76, and definitions of religion.

Week 2

Violence and identity in the early Jewish traditions.

In what sense are the Hebrew Scriptures a cause or source or explanation for Christian toleration and use of violence? Is there an essential connection between violence and monotheism? Does a people's identity as God's Chosen People necessarily entail violence against other peoples?

Monday, Sept. 16:

Reading (everyone): Excerpts from the Hebrew Scriptures: Gen 4:1-16; Num 25:1-13; Josh 5-11; 1 Kings 18:20-40; Avalos, *Fighting Words*, chapters 6 and 7: "Judaism and the Hebrew Bible." On sakai.

Reading (M.A. students): finish reading Schwartz, *Curse of Cain*.

Thursday, Sept. 19:

Reading (everyone): Robert Eisen, *The Peace and Violence of Judaism. From the Bible to Modern Zionism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 1-64. On sakai.

Writing (M.A. students): a 500-word response to Schwartz, due as an email attachment to Kolbaba@rci.rutgers.edu Thursday, Sept. 19 by 9 a.m.

For hints/help writing a response paper, see

<http://twp.duke.edu/uploads/assets/response%20paper.pdf>

<http://leo.stcloudstate.edu/acadwrite/reaction.html>

<http://homeworktips.about.com/od/essaywriting/tp/How-To-Write-A-Response-Paper.htm>

Extra meeting (M.A. Students): Discussing Schwartz and your response papers.

Weeks 3-4

Violence and identity in the early Christian traditions.

In what sense are the New Testament Scriptures a cause or source or explanation for Christian toleration and use of violence? Is there an essential connection between violence and monotheism? How do we get from the well-known New Testament record of Jesus' sayings about peace, loving one's enemies, and so on, to Christians committing violent acts against non-Christians and other Christians?

Monday, Sept. 23:

Reading (everyone): Excerpts from the New Testament: Mt 5:38-48; Mt 10; Mt 13:24-30; Mt 18:15-35; Mt 21:12-22:22; Mt 25; Lk 6:27-42; Lk 12:49-53; Lk 22:35-38; Acts 5:1-11; Gal 1; Phil 3; 2 Cor 11; Rom 16.

Reading (M.A. students only): Elizabeth Castelli, *Martyrdom and Memory. Early Christian Culture Making* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2004), beginning-103.

Thursday, Sept. 26:

Reading (everyone): Thomas R. Yoder Neufeld, *Killing Enmity. Violence and the New Testament* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2011), chapters 1 and 4, ordered EZBorrow. On sakai.

Extra meeting (M.A. students): discussing Christian Scriptures, Castelli, Neufeld.

Monday, Sept. 30:

Reading (everyone): Hector Avalos, *Fighting Words*, chapters 8-9: "Christianity and the New Testament". On sakai.

Reading (M.A. students): Begin looking for a research-paper topic by doing some preliminary reading on a subject or two that interests you. Ask Professor Kolbaba if you need some suggestions about where to start.

Thursday, Oct. 3:

Reading (everyone): Neufeld, chapters 2 and 3. On sakai.

Reading (M.A. students): Continue preliminary reading for a research-paper topic.

Extra meeting (M.A. students): discussing New Testament violence (or non-violence); discussing ideas for research papers.

Week 5

Martyrdom and the formation of Christian identity.

How does the Christian experience of martyrdom before the fourth century shape Christian communities' senses of themselves? What happens to the memory of martyrdom after the persecutions stop? What role does violence play in the formation of a Christian culture (or Christian cultures)?

Monday, Oct. 7:

Reading (everyone): "The Passion of Saints Perpetua and Felicitas", online:
<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/perpetua.asp>

Reading (M.A. students): finish Castelli, *Martyrdom and Memory*.

Writing (M.A. students): 500-word response to Castelli, e-mailed to Professor Kolbaba by 9 a.m., Thursday, Oct. 10.

Thurs. Oct.10:

Reading (everyone): Frend, "Persecutions: Genesis and Legacy", from *The Cambridge History of Christianity*, vol. 1. On sakai.

Reading (M.A. students): you should be narrowing your focus to a research topic.

Extra meeting (M.A. students): Discussing Castelli and your response papers. Lots of time for extra discussion of possible research papers.

Week 6

The Imperial Church and the Christian Empire.

What happens to the memory of martyrdom when Christians have the power to persecute others? What role does state power play in the resolution of Christian conflicts about the essence of being Christian? Return to that question from Week 2: Is intolerance a necessary result of monotheism?

Mon. Oct. 14:

Reading (everyone): Socrates Scholasticus, "Martyrs at Merum in Phrygia under Julian", *Ecclesiastical History* 3:15. Online at <http://www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/npnf202.ii.vi.xv.html>

Reading (M.A. students): Michael Gaddis, *There Is No Crime for Those Who Have Christ. Religious Violence in the Christian Roman Empire* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), Introduction and chapter 1-3.

Thurs. Oct. 17: The Imperial Church and the Christian Empire, part 2. **No new reading.**

Writing (M.A. students): 500-word proposal for your research project with a bibliography. Due by email to Professor Kolbaba Thursday, Oct. 17 by 9 a.m.

Extra meeting (M.A. students): discussing Gaddis and your research proposals.

Week 7

Still talking about the imperial church and the Christian empire. How do Christians come to use state power against one another—that is, the “orthodox” against “heretics”? How do they justify that use of state power?

Mon. Oct. 21:

Reading (everyone): Augustine of Hippo, Letters 93 and 185, available online:

<http://www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/npnf101.vii.1.XCIII.html>

<http://www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/npnf104.v.vi.ii.html> (Letter 185, also called “A Treatise Concerning the Correction of the Donatists”)

Reading (M.A. students): Gaddis ch. 4.

Thurs. Oct. 24:

Reading (everyone): Harold A. Drake, “Lambs into Lions: Explaining Early Christian Intolerance,” *Past and Present* 153 (1996): 3-36. On sakai.

M.A. students meet individually with Professor Kolbaba to discuss research-paper topics.

Week 8

Violent monks, bishops, and councils

What kinds of conversations do Christians have among themselves about righteous versus unrighteous anger and violence? Is righteous anger always on one's own side and unrighteous anger on the opponents' side? Who uses coercive power legitimately and who illegitimately?

Mon. Oct. 28:

Reading (everyone): David N. Bell, ed. and trans. *Besa: The Life of Shenoute* (Cistercian Studies Series, vol. 73; Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, 1983). Excerpts on sakai.

Reading (M.A. students): Gaddis chapters 5-6

Thurs. Oct. 31:

Reading (M.A. students): Gaddis chapters 7-end.

Writing (M.A. students): 500-word response to Gaddis, due by email to Professor Kolbaba on Thursday, Oct. 31 by 9 a.m.

Extra meeting (M.A. students): discussing Gaddis.

Week 9

Violence, boundaries, and identity, some theoretical approaches. An intermission to look at more explicitly theoretical material about religious identity and religiously motivated violence.

Monday, Nov. 4:

Reading (everyone): Inger Furseth and Pål Repstad, *An Introduction to the Sociology of Religion*, chapters 9 and 10. **On sakai.**

Thursday, Nov. 7

Reading (everyone): Paraphrase of Sizgorich, chapter 1. On Sakai.

Reading (M.A. Students only): Sizgorich, chapters 1-4.

Assignment for M.A. students: Assess the paraphrase of Sizgorich, chapter 1, on sakai. Are there places where something was lost in the translation? How would you improve the paraphrase? Write a very brief—one page or so—reflection on the use of such a paraphrase in a course. If you were teaching, would you consider such an approach? Would it be better to just make the students read the original and try to guide them through it?

Extra meeting (M.A. Students): Discussing Sizgorich and the paraphrase of Sizgorich.

Week 10

Violent interpretation of Christianity in another context: “Germanic” Christianity
In what ways does a “Germanic” culture with a ruling warrior-class shape Christianity, and vice versa? Are there parallels with the Christianization of the Roman Empire? Are some things unique about the Germanic experience? Of the models for understanding violence, boundaries, and identity that we’ve studied so far, which do you find helpful for understanding early medieval Christianity in western Europe?

Monday, Nov. 11:

Reading (everyone): James C. Russell, *The Germanization of Early Medieval Christianity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994), chapters 4 and 5. . On sakai.

Selections from *The Heliand (The Saxon Gospel)*. On sakai.

Reading (M.A. students): Lesley Abrams, “Germanic Christianities,” in *Cambridge History of Christianity, vol. 3, Early Medieval Christianities, c. 600-1100*, ed. Thomas F.X. Noble and Julia M.H. Smith (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pages 107-129. Available online through Rutgers University Libraries:

- go to libraries.rutgers.edu;
- search for Cambridge History of Christianity;
- click on the entry for *Early Medieval Christianities, c. 600-1100*;
- at the bottom of the catalogue entry there is a hyperlink that says, “Full text available from Cambridge Histories Online”; click on that;
- if you are not at a campus computer you will be asked to login with your netid and password; if you are at a campus computer you should be sent straight to a website with the full text of *Early Medieval Christianities*;
- “Germanic Christianities” is chapter 5.

Thursday, Nov. 14: No new reading.

M.A. students: thesis, outline, full bibliography of research paper due by email to Professor Kolbaba by 9 a.m.

M.A. students extra meeting: individually with Professor Kolbaba regarding research papers.

Week 11

Crusades

Where does this new kind of Christian violence come from? Is it new? Does it share features with earlier manifestations of Christian violence?

Monday, Nov. 18

Reading (everyone):

Thomas Asbridge, *The First Crusade*, ch. 1: “Holy War Proclaimed”. On sakai.

Accounts of the speech Pope Urban II made to get the ball rolling. Online at

<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/urban2-5vers.asp>

Thursday, Nov. 21

Reading (everyone): Jonathan Riley-Smith, “Crusading as an Act of Love,” *History* 65 (1980): 177-192. Available online at <http://zapasy.blox.pl/resource/love.pdf>

Week 12

Christians and Jews in Medieval Europe

Monday, Nov. 25

Reading (everyone): Chazan, *In the Year 1096*, prologue and chapters 1-3. On sakai.

Tuesday, Nov. 26 is, according to the Rutgers calendar, a THURSDAY, and therefore we meet.

NO NEW READING

Week 13

The Reformations of the 16th Century

Monday, Dec. 2

Reading (everyone): Martin Luther, “Against the Robbing and Murdering Hordes of Peasants.”
Online: <http://www.scrollpublishing.com/store/Luther-Peasants.html>

Balthasar Hubmaier, “Concerning Heretics and Those Who Burn Them”, from Denis R. Janz, *A Reformation Reader. Primary Texts with Introductions*, 2nd ed. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2008), pp. 202-203. On sakai.

“The Schleitheim Confession”, early Anabaptist summary of their beliefs, including pacifism, from Janz, *Reformation Reader*, pp. 208-211. On sakai.

Reading (M.A. students): William Cavanaugh, *The Myth of Religious Violence*, Introduction, chapters 1-2

Thursday, Dec. 5

Reading (everyone): Harold S. Bender, “The Pacifism of the Sixteenth-Century Anabaptists.”
On sakai.

Final Week

Monday, Dec. 9: M.A. students present research topics to the rest of the class.

Final papers due

By e-mail to Professor Kolbaba by 9 a.m. on Weds., Dec. 18th. (But welcome any time before that, too!)